



PLANNING COMMISSION

June 27, 2017

A special meeting of the City of Petoskey Planning Commission was held in the City Hall Council Chambers, Petoskey, Michigan, on Tuesday, June 27, 2017. Roll was called at 7:00 P.M. and the following were:

Present: Gary Greenwell, Chairperson
Dana Andrews
Betony Braddock
Dean D. Burns
James Holmes
Emily Meyerson
Rick Neumann
Cynthia Robson
Eric Yetter

Staff: Amy Tweeten, City Planner
Rob Straebel, City Manager
Lisa Denoyer, Administrative Assistant

Others Present: Deb Axelrood, SmithGroupJJR
Patti and Andy Chapman, 552 West Jefferson
Bill Culhane, Kramer Management Group
Clifford and Jane Denay, 566 West Lake Street
Kateri Ewing, 700 Hillside Drive, #31
Kristina Glusac, SmithGroupJJR
Seth Grutsch, 709 Jackson Street, Unit 3
Nancy Johnson, 550 West Lake Street
Patricia and Annie Jones, 410 Rush Street
Dan Kolinski, 9479 Mitchell Road
Brad Kranig, Barton Malow Christman
Diane Platek, 700 Hillside Drive, #25
Greg Potter, 416 Connable Avenue
Pattie Powers, 542 West Lake Street
Mike Tarwater, 301 Lafayette Avenue

Upon motion and support, minutes of the June 8, 2017 meeting were approved with recommended changes from Kristina Glusac, Project Manager, SmithGroupJJR. Motion carried 8-0, with Commissioner Burns abstaining.

**Public Hearing on Special Condition Use/Site Plan
for McLaren Northern Michigan, 416 Connable Avenue**

Staff gave a brief overview of the proposed “make ready” work area that includes the West Colleague Lot, realignment of Jackson Street, reconstruction of the Burns Lot, relocation of the PET/CT docking station and site utility underground work and noted that the hearing was not to

review any building additions other than the PET/CT docking station. She noted that her analysis of the request by the required standards of approval would be reviewed after the applicant presentation.

Kristina Glusac, SmithGroupJJR and project manager on the project, gave a brief overview of McLaren's five-year master plan that included site utility underground work at the West Colleague Lot and Burns Lot, a new docking station for the PET/CT mobile unit, five-story patient tower (two and a half stories will be underground), 92 patient rooms, new ICU, operating rooms, inpatient pharmacy and morgue, and renovations to the east building, Burns building, Heart Center and Foundation building. Ms. Glusac also stated that the new addition will be constructed with a blended brick so that it will integrate with the existing buildings and showed the Commission different viewpoint renderings to show how the new tower will impact views.

Deb Axelrod, SmithGroupJJR and landscape architect on the project stated that they were seeking approval from the Commission for the make ready work that had been proposed and informed the Commission that, per their request, the West Colleague Lot berm had been moved back in order to allow visibility of Kauffman's Furniture. Ms. Axelrod gave a brief overview of the landscape details and explained that the cooling towers would be moved onto the exiting hospital and replaced with a generator that would only run once a month for maintenance purposes. She also explained that the generator would be screened from both the roadside and lakeside.

Brad Kranig, Barton Malow Christman, commented that Phase I of the make ready work, which consists of the construction of the West Colleague Lot and realignment of Jackson Street, would begin as soon approval was granted with completion by late August. Phase II of the make ready work, which consists of the demolition of two buildings, relocation of PET/CT mobile dock and reconfiguration the Burns Lot and underground utility work, would begin in late August and conclude by November.

Staff informed the Commission that the hospital campus is located in both the B-3B and RM-2 districts and summarized the required special condition use standards in Section 1717 of the Zoning Ordinance for the three make-ready areas that were covered in more detail in the agenda memo.

- a. **The special land use type shall be located on a site of adequate size and appropriate location to make it feasible for that particular use to be compatible with surrounding land uses.**

The *West Colleague Lot* is a 386 space parking lot with access to the realigned Jackson Street. The parking spaces are between 1,000 and 1,800 feet from the current and proposed building entrances, with an employee shuttle service to be provided. The 202 spaces for *visitor parking* are adjacent to the building as currently located.

- b. **The special land use shall be designed and located in order to protect, accommodate and enhance natural or manmade features of the site such as topography, vegetation, soils, water features, historic structures and scenic views.**

West Colleague Lot located on former Road Commission and Turcott Field Property. Amount of impervious area will greatly increase, but mass of lot screened and broken up with retention areas. The trees to the north do not currently provide views of Little Traverse Bay.

- c. **The special land use shall be located on a site that can accommodate on-site traffic circulation and vehicle storage needs for the particular use. The use shall not be located on a site or arranged in a manner that would create a significant traffic or pedestrian hazard on adjacent roads or walkways.** The calculation of parking indicates the ordinance requirement is met with an increase of 200 parking spaces over

current campus numbers. The crosswalk on the curve in the realigned Jackson Street has been pointed out as a potential pedestrian hazard.

d. The special land use and its accessory uses and structures shall be located and arranged on the site in a manner allowing for adequate buffering and screening to protect adjacent uses and properties where needed.

The West Colleague Lot is adequately screened from Charlevoix Avenue; Burns Lot showing perimeter Potentilla shrub (2-3 feet) and street trees.

e. The scale, bulk, elevation, exterior materials and color of the buildings in the special land use shall be designed to blend with the character of the surrounding land uses and neighborhood. Where the bulk, scale or elevation of such buildings varies greatly from the surrounding structures, greater setbacks may be required;

PET/CT Dock meets standard; Not applicable to make-ready work.

f. The special land use shall not be located where, due to use of particular equipment, or import, storage or production of certain materials, or emission of waste products, it would be a significant hazard to adjacent properties;

The relocation of the underground storage tanks to the PET/CT Dock area should not create a significant hazard.

Additional Special Condition Use standards for hospitals:

A. All such hospitals shall be developed only on sites consisting of at least ten acres in area; Standard met

b. The proposed site shall have at least one property line abutting a major thoroughfare as designated on the major thoroughfare plan. Standard met

c. The minimum distance of any main or accessory building from building lot lines or streets shall be at least 100 feet for front, rear and side yards for all two-story structures. For every story above two, the minimum yard distance shall be increased by at least two feet. Not Applicable to make-ready work.

Staff reiterated her recommended conditions of approval for the plan set dated May 4, 2017, presentation materials dated May 18, 2017, metal panel materials provided at the June 8 meeting and revised lighting calculations dated June 13, 2017, which included:

1. Completion of the Jackson Street realignment to connect to existing Jackson Street with first phase of construction;
2. Approval of a sign plan by the Planning Commission;
3. Irrigation of the West Colleague Lot;
4. Final approval of all utilities and connections;
5. Reduction of parking spaces in the West Colleague Lot;

At this time, the meeting was opened for public comment.

Nancy Johnson, 550 West Lake Street, stated that she lives across the street from the hospital's parking structure and wondered if there were any changes planned for the parking structure and asked where the nearest changes would be.

Commissioner Greenwell commented that there are no planned changes for the parking structure at this time and that the nearest changes would be the PET/CT mobile dock relocation.

Diane Platek, 700 Hillside Drive #25, asked if the West Colleague Lot would only be accessible from Jackson Street, what the hours of construction would be, if all construction vehicles would access the site from Charlevoix Avenue and if the lot would have on-site irrigation.

Commissioner Greenwell commented that he believed that construction hours were from 7:00 A.M. to 7:00 P.M. and that the estimated completion date for the parking lot was late August.

Greg Potter, McLaren Northern Michigan, commented that he believed that permitted construction hours were from 7:00 A.M. to 6:00 P.M., possibly until 7:00 P.M., there would be a staging area for construction vehicles and that there would be a gate inset on Jackson Street to allow access for construction vehicles from Charlevoix Avenue.

Staff commented that the new Jackson Street would be aligned with Greenwood Cemetery Road.

Jane Denay, 566 West Lake Street, asked if there would be sidewalks along the new Jackson Street, who owns the Quonset hut and the old Emmet County Road Commission building, commented that the cooling towers create quite a bit of noise pollution and asked if the new cooling tower would have protection for noise, if there was any noise associated with the PET/CT mobile unit and if there would be a sound barrier. Ms. Denay also commented that there has been a great improvement with street parking on Lake Street and asked if there would be any relief for Jefferson Street parking.

Commissioner Greenwell commented that there would be sidewalks along the new Jackson Street, the hospital owns both buildings, the cooling towers will be moved to the top of the building so it is unlikely that they would be heard from below and that it is hoped that there will be parking relief for the Jefferson Street area but there is no public safety mechanism to enforce.

Mr. Potter commented that there are heating and cooling units that will run for the PET/CT mobile unit but that they are no different than an in-home unit and will only run two days per week for approximately eight to nine hours.

Andy Chapman, 552 West Jefferson Street commented that he is confident that the changes will look beautiful like the rest of the hospital.

Patty Chapman, 552 West Jefferson Street asked what changes would be made to the laundry area of the foundation building.

Mr. Potter commented that they will be adding garage bays but that there will be minimal impact on the use of that area.

Commissioner Greenwell commented that he believed there would be less activity with the maintenance department moving there than there currently is with the laundry facility.

Clifford Denay, 566 West Lake Street, commented that he is concerned about traffic on Lake Street and asked if there would be any construction vehicles on Lake Street. He commented that a large amount of summer visitors are coming down Lake Street on bicycles and about 60% or more are not wearing helmets and do not stay to the side of the street and that campers traveling to and from Magnus Park often exceed the speed limit, both of which cause concern about additional traffic on Lake Street. He also commented that he appreciates the relocation of the cooling towers, as they are extremely loud and voiced concerns about noise levels from the large oxygen truck that replenishes the oxygen tanks near the parking structure late at night. He also commented that the large dump trucks that haul snow at night during the winter months often run up and down Lake Street well past midnight and create a lot of noise when the dump box slams down after dumping snow.

Commissioner Greenwell commented that maybe the hospital could look at a possible daytime delivery for oxygen.

Mrs. Denay commented that she believes they deliver at night due to parking issues.

Hadie Powers, 542 West Lake Street, asked if she could see the viewpoint rendering from West Lake Street again and Ms. Glusac briefly reviewed the rendering as requested.

Commissioner Greenwell reminded the public that the Commission was not approving the building at this time but rather the parking.

Mrs. Chapman stated that she had heard that the generator near their home was to be removed and asked if that was true.

Mr. Potter responded that the large green box near their home was actually an electric transformer and that another one will be added rather than removed.

There being no further public comment, the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Robson commented that she had no concerns with the plans presented but asked if an agreement could be made on irrigation and reduction of parking at the West Colleague Lot.

Commissioner Burns commented that he had no issues with the plans as presented.

Commissioner Meyerson commented that the Quonset hut and old Emmet County Road Commission buildings are very visible and that she had concerns with broken windows and repair needs and feels they should be improved. She also commented that she believes the location of the crosswalk near the West Colleague Lot would be better placed by the trail crossing and that she would prefer there only be one crossing that is more visible.

Commissioner Greenwell commented that the crosswalk is intended for employees to get to the shuttle drop-off/pick-up from the small adjacent parking lot that only has about 30 parking spaces.

Bill Culhane, Program Manager for Kramer, Grand Rapids, MI, commented that they would work with staff to relocate the crosswalk.

Commissioner Neumann commented that he believes there is adequate visibility because of the large radius curve.

Commissioner Greenwell commented that cars turn that corner faster than one would think.

Commissioner Meyerson commented that she believes it would be better to funnel pedestrians to one crossing and that she agreed with staff that irrigation be required and parking should be reduced by 30 spaces as more spaces could be added later.

Commissioner Greenwell asked if there would be parking permits for the parking lots or if they would be available on a first-come-first-serve basis and voiced a concern about the parking lot being full after the first shift arrived and therefore leaving no spaces for the next shift. He also asked what the hours of operation would be for the shuttle service.

Mr. Potter commented that parking permits are for all employees, parking would be available on a first-come-first-serve basis and that they have not developed long-term parking. He also commented that there would be a staggering of employee arrival times as shifts start at almost any hour and that the shuttle service will run from 5:00 or 6:00 A.M until 8:00 P.M. to try to cover all shifts.

Mr. Culhane commented that the largest concern with parking that they have heard from City staff is parking in neighborhoods and the hospital has taken action by hiring a parking service. The loss of on-street parking along Lake Street for the bike lane has created a need for an estimated 200 additional parking spaces. They have concerns with shift times and insufficient parking and are trying to bring parking onto private property rather than on the streets. Mr. Culhane also commented that it is very expensive to add parking spots later should parking be insufficient.

Mr. Potter commented that the new scenario is that the Burns Building and hospital entrances will offer valet parking and they will need a portion of spaces from the lot near Wendy's. He stated that they feel strongly that they owe it to their colleagues to create enough parking so they do not have to drive around searching for parking.

Commissioner Andrews commented that most of his concerns had already been addressed, that he was not comfortable tying specific improvements to a building and that he believed that the hospital would improve the outbuildings if necessary. He also commented that he felt that if a private property owner chose not to irrigate new vegetation that it is their right and that he does not believe the parking spaces should be reduced because they will be needed in five years with the development of the site.

Commissioner Neumann commented that he does not like to see parking overbuilt but he does not have any issues with the parking counts for the proposed project. He also commented that he was happy to see the berm moved back and that irrigation would be ideal but that it should not be a condition of approval. He stated that if there was anything unsafe or unsightly with the Quonset hut or old Emmet County Road Commission building that it be fixed.

Commissioner Yetter commented that requiring irrigation was within their purview and that without the irrigation requirement the standards would not be met.

Ms. Axelrod informed the Commission that water bags would be installed on trees, they would be planting drought tolerant plants and that a contractor would be watering the plants until they are established.

Commissioner Yetter agreed that the standards for approval would not be met without irrigation and asked if there would be a guarantee on the plants and trees should they not survive. He commented that Charlevoix Avenue is an entrance to the community and the plant life should be vibrant and beautiful.

Commissioner Braddock commented that the Commission had gone over the plans thoroughly and that she appreciated the relocation of the berm and irrigation is needed. She commented that it would be nice if there were a way to encourage employees not to park on Jefferson Street.

Commissioner Robson commented that a lot of light would be created by the lights in the West Colleague Lot and asked if they could be turned down or off during non-peak times.

Mr. Potter commented that a reduction in lighting could create an unsafe situation and that he does not believe it is in the best interest of the hospital or its employees. He also commented that security cameras will be installed in the parking lot and would be ineffective if the lights were turned down or off.

Mr. Culhane commented that the photo metrics comply with the ordinance and that there is a reduced lead over the property line.

Ms. Axelrod commented that the light will not have a great impact on Magnus Park due to the grade difference and number of trees between the parking lot and Park.

Commissioner Meyerson asked that the timeline of the project be reviewed.

Mr. Culhane commented that Phase I, which includes the West Colleague Lot and realignment of Jackson Street, will be complete in late August and that Phase II, which includes the Burns Lot and utility underground work, will be complete before winter.

Mr. Potter stated that there will be intermittent closures of the ring road for underground utilities but they anticipate all work to be completed by November. He also commented piping for the cooling towers will be done over the winter, it is anticipated that the south patient tower will be complete by 2020 and that other interior changes are planned to be completed between 2020 and 2022.

Mr. Chapman asked if there were any changes planned for the emergency room.

Mr. Potter responded that it will remain the same.

Commissioner Greenwell asked if the hospital would have plans for the Commission to review for the south patient tower by this fall.

Mr. Culhane replied that they would.

Rob Straebel, City Manager, commented that the City will be working with the hospital on a formal agreement for the crossing of park land in order to realign Jackson Street.

Commissioner Greenwell asked about utility work and Mr. Straebel commented that the utilities within the Jackson Street extension that would be reconstructed to just east of the ring road would have to be replaced at the hospital's expense. Utility replacement includes the existing north/south water main as well as all utilities located within the new extension that runs from Jackson Street to Charlevoix Avenue. Utilities east of the ring road will be replaced by the City at the time of the full street reconstruction.

Commissioner Andrews made a motion to approve the special condition use for McLaren Northern Michigan three make-ready areas based on the finding that they meet the special condition use standards of approval:

- a. The special land use type is located on a site of adequate size and appropriate location to make it feasible for that particular use to be compatible with surrounding land uses.
- b. The special land use is designed and located in order to protect, accommodate and enhance natural or manmade features of the site such as topography, vegetation, soils, water features, historic structures and scenic views.
- c. The special land use is located on a site that can accommodate its on-site traffic circulation and vehicle storage needs and is not located on a site or arranged in a manner that would create a significant traffic or pedestrian hazard on adjacent roads or walkways.
- d. The special land use and its accessory uses and structures is located and arranged on the site in a manner allowing for adequate buffering and screening to protect adjacent uses and properties where needed.
- e. The scale, bulk, elevation, exterior materials and color of the buildings in the special land use is designed to blend with the character of the surrounding land uses and neighborhood.
- f. The special land is not a significant hazard to adjacent properties;

And the standards of approval specific to a hospital area are also met.

Support for the motion was made by Commissioner Meyerson and the motion carried. 9-0.

Commissioner Andrews then made a motion to approve the site plan submitted by McLaren Northern Michigan for the three make-ready areas based on the site plan performance standards of Section 1716 A through K being met subject to the following conditions:

1. Completion of the Jackson Street realignment to connect to existing Jackson Street with first phase of construction;
2. Approval of a sign plan by the Planning Commission; and
3. Final approval of all utilities and connections.

Commissioner Robson stated that she would like irrigation of the West Colleague Lot added as a condition of approval.

Commissioner Meyerson agreed and commented that she believed that the Jackson Street extension crosswalk relocation should also be a condition of approval.

Commissioner Andrews amended his motion to include the relocation of the Jackson Street extension crosswalk and asked Commissioners what specific requirements should be set for irrigation.

Commissioner Meyerson and Commissioner Yetter both stated that underground irrigation should be required to maintain vegetation.

Commissioner Andrews made a final motion amendment, seconded by Commissioner Meyerson to approve the site plan submitted by McLaren Northern Michigan with the following conditions.

1. Completion of the Jackson Street realignment to connect to existing Jackson Street with first phase of construction;
2. Approval of a sign plan by the Planning Commission;
3. Final approval of all utilities and connections;
4. An underground irrigation system for the West Colleague Lot; and
5. Relocation of the Jackson Street extension crosswalk.

Motion carried 9-0.

Discussion on Zoning Ordinance Amendment for McLaren Northern Michigan

Staff reminded the Commission that McLaren Northern Michigan had withdrawn their request for a zoning amendment and asked the Commission if they would prefer to amend the RM-1 District setback requirements for hospitals, create a new hospital zoning district or a combination of the two.

Commissioners discussed the pros and cons of each option and decided that the best option was to create a new Hospital Zoning District.

Staff asked Commissioners what they felt the minimum timeframe should be for a Master Site and Facilities Plan and stated that she believed that Traverse City requires a 10-year plan.

Mr. Potter commented that the hospital's short-term plan is 5 years and their long-term plan is 15 to 20 years.

Commissioners agreed that they would prefer more than a 10-year plan.

Updates

Staff informed the Commission that City Council held a second reading on the ordinance amendments for boarding houses and would like more controls put in place, a Parks and Recreation Master Plan workshop will be held on July 11 and 12 from 9:00 A.M. to 7:00 P.M. in the City Hall Community Room where the general public can give input on City parks and recreation programs, staff is currently in the process of updating the Capital Improvement Plan and that a resolution for vacation rental legislation will need to go to City Council.

Commissioner Andrews asked about the Downtown Strategic Plan process to which staff replied that there was a great turn out of retailers for Mr. Gibbs presentation and that he will be summarizing recommendations based on comments made. This report is anticipated to be available in two to three weeks and can be incorporated into the overall plan.

Commissioners Neumann and Braddock commented that they thought it was a great presentation.

The meeting then adjourned at 8:56 P.M.

Minutes reviewed and approved by Emily Meyerson, Vice Chairperson/Secretary